





BY ELIEZER BRODT

FLOWERS ON SHAVUOS





All over the world florists are kept busy Shavuot time, as Jews have the custom to buy elaborate bouquets and floral arrangements to decorate their *shuls* and homes with flowers and plants. The question that I would like to address in this article is what are the earliest sources for it and the reason for the opposition of some against this custom.¹

There is almost no mention of any form of this custom in the *Rishonim* [except for the few sources about to be discussed]. The Rambam and the *Tur* do not bring it down; neither does Rav Yosef Karo bring this *minhag* in either his *Beis Yosef* or *Shulchan Aruch* in *Hilchos Shavuot*. The Rama in his glosses to the *Shulchan Aruch*, called the “*Mapah*,” brings that there is a custom to spread grass in *shuls* and homes.” The Rama in *Darhei Moshe* uncharacteristically does not say what his exact source for this *minhag* is.

However, we find that Rav Zalman of St. Goar (1360-1427), in his work *Sefer Maharil*, writes that there is a custom to spread on the *shul’s* floor roses and grass that smell good.² This is also brought in the *Hagahos Haminhagim* to Rav Tirnah’s *Sefer Minhagim*³ and by Rav Binyamin Halevi in the *Machzor Maagalei Tzedek* (first printed in 1550).⁴

The *Sefer Maharil* and Rav Tirnah’s *Sefer Minhagim* are important sources that the Rama used very often⁵; however, here it appears that there are some differences between them. The first difference between them is that the *Maharil* only talks about *shuls* where the Rama adds homes. The second difference is that the *Maharil* says to spread it on the floors; the Rama makes no mention of floors. A third difference is that the *Maharil* says to spread nice smelling items, while the Rama just talks about grass.

Another early source for this *minhag* is found in the *Leket Yosher*, written by a student of Rav Yisrael Isserlin, author of the *Terumas Hadeshen*. The student writes that Rav Isserlin’s household used to spread out on the first day of Shavuot grass and *besamim* that were prepared before Shavuot.⁶ Here we see a source for part of the Rama, as he mentions grass and homes. It’s possible that he had it in manuscript, as this work was first printed from manuscript in Berlin in 1903.⁷

An additional very early source for this *minhag* can be found in the work *Machberes Emanuel* from Emanuel Haromi. This work was written around 1321.⁸ He writes that he found a *remez* in an old work that one should decorate the *shuls* with roses.⁹ As an aside worth pointing out about this work is that although it is very well known, this work was banned by the *Beis Yosef*.¹⁰ The Chida

in his *Shem Hagedolim*¹¹ writes that the best work on *Mishlei* was written by Emanuel!

The Levush (1530-1612) brings the *minhag* exactly as his teacher¹² the Rama does. Rabbi Yosef Hann Norlingen (1570-1637) writes in *Yosef Ometz* (first printed in 1723), after bringing the *Maharil*, that in Frankfurt the custom was to spread the flowers on the floors of the houses, too.¹³

Rabbi Yehudah Aryeh Modena (1571-1648) printed a work called *Historia de Riti Hebraici* in 1637, which was originally written in Italian as a gift for the King of England to explain Jewish customs (of Italy).¹⁴ He writes that on Shavuot “they adorn their schools and places where they read the law and their houses with roses, flowers, garlands and... the like.”¹⁵

A bit later the custom, as the *Maharil* has it, is brought by Rabbi Chaim Benveniste (1603-1673), in his work *Shiurei Knesses Hagedolah*,¹⁶ *Eliyahu Rabbah*,¹⁷ Rav Yaakov Emden (1698-1776) in his *siddur*,¹⁸ *Shulchan Shlomo*,¹⁹ Rav Shlomo Chelma (1716-1781)²⁰ and the *Shulchan Aruch Harav*.²¹

In communities such as Worms,²² Wertzburg,²³ Breslau,²⁴ many *chasidus* communities²⁵ and amongst Persian Jews,²⁶ we also find that they observed this *minhag*.

Be that as it may, it’s clear that there are numerous sources for all aspects of the *minhag*, whether it’s for placing them in *shul* or homes, grass, roses, flowers on the floor, etc.

REASONS

However, what is the reason for this *minhag*? As with many *minhagim* of ours, numerous reasons have been written, based on all methods of learning, whether based on *drush*, *remez*, *Kabbalah* or *chasidus*.²⁷ I would just like to quote the earliest reasons given for this custom.

The *Maharil* writes that the reason is for *simchas Yom Tov*. If that’s the case, the question is why specifically is this custom found only in association with Shavuot and not with any other Yom Tov?²⁸

The Rama gives another reason linking it specifically to Shavuot, as it’s a remembrance to the Giving of the Torah. The question is: How is that so? The Levush adds that we find that the Jews were told to stay away from Sinai at the time of the giving of the Torah and that they should keep away the animals. So the Levush says that it would appear that there was grass at the mountain—thus the custom to spread grass on the floors.²⁹

ANOTHER ASPECT: SMELLING FLOWERS

However, it appears that there is another aspect of this *minhag*. The Shelah, in his notes printed in his father’s work *Eimek Brachah* (first printed in 1597)³⁰ and then again in his classic work *Shelah*



Hakadosh, brings that the *shul's* *shamash* gives flowers and grass out to smell during *davening*. This *minhag* is dealt with by the *poskim* aside from the Shelah as to when exactly one can make a *brachah* on them during *davening*.³¹

Rabbi Yuzpeh Shamash (1604-1678) of Worms describes how, depending on the status of the person in the community, he got certain flowers.³² The anonymous work *Chemdas Yomim* (printed in 1735) also brings this custom and says to give out the flowers when the Torah is taken out to avoid any issues.³³ In Salonika, Greece they also did this.³⁴

This aspect of the *minhag* leads to the next part.

As I mentioned earlier there are no early sources to this *minhag*. However the Chida (1724-1806) points to a possible early source. He refers to a *midrash* that Haman told Achashveirosh that the Jews spread grass out on Shavuot.³⁵ He does not give exact details to his source but it appears that he is referring to a *midrash* brought in the *Targum Sheini* on *Esther* (3:8), which says that on Atzeres they would go to the roofs of their *shuls* and they would throw down stuff, which is gathered. In Amsterdam in 1770 a commentary on this *targum* was printed, which added in a few words to this *midrash* that they threw down apples and grass.³⁶ This is the source for many to show that spreading out grass on Shavuot is very early.³⁷ However, in all other earlier editions of this *Targum Sheini*, the words apples and grass do not appear; neither do they appear in other *midrashim* that have this same *midrash*. Even more so, there are numerous early sources in the *Rishonim* to throw apples on Simchas Torah; some *chasidim* even do so today, as they understand the word *Atzeres* to be referring to Sukkos-Shemini Atzeres and not Shavuot.³⁸ Now the *Chemdas Yamim* who, as previously

mentioned, brings the custom of distributing flowers when the Torah is taken out, points to the *Targum Sheini* as his source. The Chida is known to have used this work, so perhaps he was basing it on this.³⁹

ADDITIONAL SOURCES

Many of the sources of information about how various *minhagim* were observed come from non-Jews or *meshumadim*, which must obviously be used with caution.

Johannes Buxtorf (1564-1629) writes in his *Synagoga Judaica*: “In memory of the law, they spread grass in their houses, on the streets and in their *shuls*, and they place greenery in the windows, just as it was around Mount Sinai, which was green when they received the law.”⁴⁰ Johann Eisenmenger (1654-1704) also brings this,⁴¹ as does Hyam Isaacs in *Ceremonies, Customs, Rites and Traditions of the Jews*, first printed in 1794.⁴²

In the book *Religion, Ceremonies and Prayers of the Jews*, Gamaliel Ben Pedazhur (1738) writes: “Their synagogues are adorned with flowers and their houses, their tables and floors and other greens...”⁴³

Some of these books are illustrated and have drawings of *shuls* decorated with flowers on Shavuot, such as from Paul Kirchner (1716) and Johann Bodenschatz (1748).

One famous Jewish painter worth pointing to is Moritz Oppenheim (1800-1882). In the 1850s he began a series of pictures called “Scenes from the Traditional Jewish Family Life.” The series was completed in the 1880s. The painting of Shavuot shows a *shul* decorated with flowers and trees.⁴⁴

TREES



Until now, most of the sources discussed, especially the early ones, talk about using flowers, roses, or grass; none of the sources, such as the *Maharil*, *Leket Yosher*, *Machberes Emanuel* or the Rama mention trees or tree branches. Where does this part of the custom come from? It is not clear when and how it began, but the *Magen Avraham* (first printed in 1692) brings that in his day (he died in 1683⁴⁵) people had the custom to put up trees in homes and in *shuls*.

The *Magen Avraham* even suggests that the reason for this was that since Shavuot is the time when we are judged on the fruits of trees, this will remind people to *daven* for it.⁴⁶

After the *Magen Avraham* wrote this, we find it brought in many *Acharonim*, such as The *Gan Nuta* from Rav Nosson Nuta Eiger (first printed in 1695),⁴⁷ *Eliyahu Rabbah*,⁴⁸ Rabbi Yair Chaim Bachrach of Worms (1638-1702) in *Mekor Chaim*, Rabbi Yaakov Reischer (1660-1733) in *Chok Yaakov* on *hilchos Pesach* (first printed in 1696 in Dessau), Rav Yaakov Emden in his *siddur*,⁴⁹ *Shulchan Shlomo*⁵⁰ (Rav Shlomo Chelma⁵¹) and the *Shulchan Aruch Harav*.⁵²

OPPOSITION AGAINST THIS MINHAG AND THE GRA

In the *Aruch Hashulchan* we find that he writes something very cryptic on this subject. He begins that there is a custom to spread grass in *shul*; then he says that some put trees, but in recent generations trees and grass were stopped for reasons that the *gedolim* knew.⁵³

It would appear that the *Aruch Hashulchan* is referring to the *shitah* of the Gra.

Rav Avraham Danzig in his *Chayei Adam* brings from the Gra that he stopped the custom of putting up trees on Shavuot as the

goyim put up trees for their holidays.⁵⁴ This *psak* was first printed in the *Chayei Adam* in 1809 and again in his work on *Yoreh Dei'ah*, the *Chochmas Adam*, printed in 1815.⁵⁵ In 1832 a similar statement was brought in the *Maasei Rav* of the Gra, not to put up trees on Shavuot.⁵⁶

The reason given for the Gra by both the *Chayei Adam* and the *Maasei Rav* is that it is now a non-Jewish custom to decorate with trees, meaning that it's an issue of *chukos hagoyim*.⁵⁷

It's clear from some of the literature written on the subject that they understood the Gra to be referring to Xmas trees. For example, the Maharsham, who writes that since the *goyim* do it outside their houses and we do it inside, then it is not an issue, as we are doing it differently from them.⁵⁸ Rav Yosef Ginsburg also writes that the Gra's opposition was to the putting of trees outside *shul*, not inside.⁵⁹

Another basis for why it would not be an issue according to the Maharsham is because there is a reason for this *minhag*, as the *Magen Avraham* stated that once we have a reason, then it does not make a difference that the *goyim* do it.

Another basis for why it would not be an issue is given by the *Sho'el Umeishiv*, where based on the *goyim* that he had asked and who said that they only do it for beauty, that it should look nice, so it is not *chukos hagoyim*.⁶⁰

In *Litvish* sources like the Aderes,⁶¹ *Mishnah Berurah*,⁶² Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach⁶³, the Steipler Gaon,⁶⁴ Rav Shmuel Munk⁶⁵ and Rav Avigdor Neventzal,⁶⁶ it appears that they understood the Gra's issue to be specifically about trees, not about flowers.

However Rav Moshe Feinstein understood it to be on both trees



and flowers,⁶⁷ as did the *Aruch Hashulchan*, quoted earlier. Rav Moshe related that when he was young, the *bachurim* from Volozhin would remove the trees from *shul*, causing fights in the city.⁶⁸

In a memoir about the Lomza Yeshivah, the author writes that they followed the Gra and did not have flowers.⁶⁹

The truth is that it's not so simple, since, although both the *Chayei Adam* and the *Maasei Rav* only say trees, there is a manuscript of a *talmid* of the Gra who specifically writes that the Gra's issue was with both trees and flowers.⁷⁰

So, what holiday was the Gra referring to? Was it indeed Xmas? In the first edition of the *Chayei Adam* he adds in that

it's the holiday of Pentecost.⁷¹ This holiday was 50 days after Easter and is meant to copy our Shavuot; thus it is almost the exact same time. One of the things that was done to celebrate this holiday was to decorate their churches with trees. According to this, it appears to be a local custom in the Gra's city, as not everyone who celebrated it did so with trees. It's unclear if they used greenery and flowers, as some sources appear to say that in certain places they did. According to this, elsewhere (i.e., outside of Vilna), where they did not recognize this holiday, it would not be an issue. As a similar point, Rav Avigdor Neventzal writes that in Eretz Yisrael, where they do not do any such thing, the Gra would not

1 For useful collections on this topic, see Rabbi Pinchas Schwartz, *Minchah Chadashah*, p. 33a-35a; Dov Sadan, *Gilgul Moadim*, p. 149-160; Rav Ovadia Yosef, *Shu"t Yechaveh Daas*, 4:33 and his *Chazon Ovadia* (Yom Tov), p. 317-318; Rav Mondshine, *Otzar Minaghei Chabad*, p. 293-294; Rabbi Gedaliah Oberlander, *Minhag Avoseinu B'yadeinu*, 2, p. 573-604; Rabbi Tuviah Freund, *Moadim L-Simchah*, 6, p. 398-419; *Pardes Eliezer*, p. 31-69; Rabbi Gur-Aryeh, *Chikrei Minhagim*, 3, p. 60-66; Daniel Sperber, *Minhagei Yisrael*, 1, p. 118-120; *ibid*, 6, p. 147-148; Rabbi Yitzchack Tesler, *Peninei Minhag*, p. 61-77; Rav Levi Cooper, Sinai 120 (1997), p. 230-250; Shlomo Glicksberg, *Siach Hasadeh* 5 (2008) p. 41-62 [Thanks to Rav Menachem Silber for this source]. See also Eliezer Brodt, *Halachic Commentaries to the Shulchan Aruch on Orach Chayim from Ashkenaz and Poland in the Seventeenth Century*, PhD, Bar Ilan University) July 2015. p. 363-367. Thanks to Rabbi Bin-yomin Shlomo Hamberger of Mechon Moreshet Ashkenaz for providing me with his collection of sources on this *minhag*. In the future I hope to return to this subject more in depth.

2 Maharil, p.160. On this work see the Y. Pelles, *The Book of Maharil According to its autograph manuscripts and its speciality as a Multi-Draft versions work* (PhD, Bar Ilan University 2005).

3 *Sefer Minhagim*, p. 67. It is unclear exactly who the author is of this section

but it is assumed to have been written rather early on and is quoted often by the Rema. On all of this, see S. Spitzer in his introduction to this edition p. 17-18. 4 *Maagalei Tzedek*, p. 87

5 See my forthcoming article on the subject.

6 *Leket Yosher*, p. 103.

7 The Rama had other sources from this school in manuscript.

8 On Emanuel Haromi in general, see: M. Steinschneider, *Jewish Literature*, p. 176; Landshuth, *Amudei Haavodah* p. 304-305; Davidson, *Parody in Jewish Literature*, p. 17-19; Y. Zinberg, *Toldos Sifrut Yisrael*, 1, p. 387-410; A. Haberman, *Toldos Hapiyut V-hashirah*, vol. 2, p. 43-61; Dov Yarden in his introduction to his edition of *Machberes Emanuel Haromi* p. 11-18. See also Rabbi Shmuel Askenazi, *Alpha Beita Tenysah*, 1. 2011, p. 210-214.

9 *Machberes Emanuel*, p. 398 See Davidson, *Parody in Jewish Literature*, p. 19-20. For others who used this *remez* see Brodt (above note 1), p. 363 note 162.

For the exact definition of Roses see Zohar Amar, *Tzemachei Hamikra* p. 231-234.

10 On the banning of *Machberes Emanuel* see Beis Yosef (O.C. 307:16); Moshe Carmily, *Sefer V-sayif* p. 40-44; A. Haberman, *Toldos Hapiyut V-hashirah*, vol. 2, p. 56-58.

One other point of interest about this work: I found in the list of works for

students to learn, thought out a new school system written by R. Meshulam Roth, the great *Galicianer posek*, at the request of R. Meir Shapiro – amongst the many interesting things he wanted *talmidim* to read was the sefer *Machberes!* [Printed in back of his R. M. Roth *Mevaser Ezra* on Ibn Ezra p. 176].

11 Pointed out to me by Rav Shmuel Askenazi. See *Shem Hagedolim, Maareches Sefarim: Kuntres Acharon* (printed at the end of letter beis). This work on *Mishlei* was one of the first books ever printed in Naples 1487. It was reprinted in a limited facsimile edition in 1981 with an excellent introduction.

12 See Eliezer Brodt (above note 1), p. 107.

13 *Yosef Ometz*, 851.

14 See Howard Ernest Adelman, *Success and Failure in the Seventeenth Century Ghetto of Venice: The Life of Leon Modena, 1571-1643*, (PhD, Brandeis University), 1985; Eliezer Brodt, *Likutei Eliezer*, p. 86-87.

15 *History of the Rites, Customs and Manner of Life of the Present Jews Throughout the World*, London 1650, p. 135.

16 494:2.

17 494:2.

18 *Siddur Rav Yaakov Emden*, 2, p. 149.

19 494:6.

20 *Shulchan Tamid*, p. 105.

21 494:14.

22 *Minhagim De-Kehal Vermeizah* (1988), p. 110; see also *Minhagim Ver-*

VERTICAL 1/3

{w} 2.5 X {h} 10.3



have any issues. Similarly, Rav Elyashiv said the same.⁷²

Interestingly enough, Ludwig Frankel, who visited Jerusalem in 1856, records how on Shavuot they do not have flowers on the floor or decorating the *shuls* like back home in Vienna.⁷³ In yet another source, a fascinating work describing Eretz Yisrael in the 1840s, written by Rav Yosef Schwarz (1804-1865), he also writes that on Shavuot they did not have flowers or trees in *shul*.⁷⁴ It could be that this had to do with the Gra. However, at some later time, people in Jerusalem started to decorate the homes and *shuls* on Shavuot.

Yet Rav Avraham Chaim Naeh (author of *Ketzos Hashulchan*) writes in the *halachah* section of his calendar from 1931 that the *minhag* is to decorate the *shuls* and houses with grass and trees.⁷⁵

Returning to Vilna, in 1824 a parody called the *Sefer Hakundas* (trickster) was written by a *maskil* and printed in Vilna. Through this parody we get a very interesting glimpse into Jewish life in those days. When talking about Shavuot, he writes that they used to decorate the walls with *raislich*,⁷⁶ which are paper flowers.⁷⁷

Further on in the work he describes how they would make a decoration on the wall from grass. Yet in a source from Vilna in 1906, he describes how the Gra abolished the custom.⁷⁸

Rav Deblitski writes that he heard from a reliable source who was in Vilna before World War II that even in the Gra's *shul* they decorated it with trees.⁷⁹

In other *Litvish* places or people we find Pauline Wengeroff (b. 1833 in Minsk). In her memoirs she wrote: "All the rooms were bedecked with greens and magnificently lit."⁸⁰ Her father was Rav Epstein, a *talmid* of Rav David Tevel, author of *Nachalas David*; he was a *talmid* of Rav Chaim Volozhiner.⁸¹ There is another description of Lithuania that the author writes: "The Jew adorns his home (with grass, etc.) in the honor of Shavuot."⁸²

In another memoir describing life in Minsk in the 1860s, the author describes how they decorated the *shuls* and homes with grass.⁸³

Be that as it may, in most circles today Jews decorate their homes and *shuls* with trees and flowers. ●

meizah, p. 255.
 23 *Likutei Tzvi*, p. 16-18
 24 *Dinim Uminhagim LBeis Haknesses Chevras Ha-achim* (1833), p. 14
 25 See for example Rav Mondshine, *Otzar Minaghei Chabad*, p. 293-294; Minaghei Mahariv, p. 300.
 26 C. Mizrach, *Yehudei Paras*, p. 34-35.
 27 See the various collections mentioned in the first footnote.
 28 See the important comment of Rabbi Gedaliah Oberlander, *Minhag Avoseinu B'yadeinu*, 2, p. 578-579.
 29 See the important comments of Rabbi Gedaliah Oberlander, *Minhag Avoseinu B'yadeinu*, 2, p. 579-582.
 30 p. 265.
 31 See the *Magen Avraham*, 494:9; *Chok Yaakov* and others.
 32 *Minhagim D-Kahal Vermeizah* (1988), p. 110 see also *Minhagim Vermeizah*, p. 255.
 33 *Chemdas Yamim* 2, (2011), p. 571.
 34 *Shulchan Gavoah*, 494:6. See also *Zichron Yehudah*, p. 78.
 35 *Birkei Yosef*, 494:6.
 36 For sources on all this see Brodt (above note 1), p. 363-364.
 37 See Rav Ovadia Yosef, *Shu"t Yechaveh Daas*, 4:33.
 38 On the general custom to throw

apples, see Rabbi Hamberger, *Shorshei Minhag Ashkenaz*, 4, p. 430-461; Rabbi Tessler, *Heichal Habesht* 20 (2008) p. 75-100; sources cited in Brodt (above note 1), p. 364.
 39 On the Chida and *Chemdas Yamim* see my article in *Yeshurun* 32 (2015) p. 862-863. The issue is that I cannot find a *targum sheini* that says the word "grass" even in the edition printed near the *Chemdas* in 1732.
 40 *Synagoga Judaica*.
 41 *The Traditions of the Jews*, USA 2006, p. 820. On this work see E. Carlebach, *Divided Souls*, London 2001, p. 212-221.
 42 p. 112.
 43 p. 56.
 44 L. Stein, *Family Scenes from Jewish Life of Former Days*, New York 1866, ch. 5. G. Heuberger & A. Merk, *Moritz Daniel Openheim*, Wein and Verlag 1999; R. Cohen, *Jewish Icons*, California 1998, p. 163-170.
 45 See Brodt (above note 1), p. 43.
 46 The Shelah already brings the *Toeles Yaakov* who connects *tefilos* on Shavuot to this that we are judged on the fruit.
 47 494.
 48 494:2.

49 *Siddur Rav Yaakov Emden*, 2, p. 149.
 50 494:6.
 51 *Shulchan Tamid*, p. 105.
 52 494:15.
 53 494:6. see Rav T. Tribitz, *Yeshurun* 33 (2015), p. 402.
 54 *Chayei Adam*, 131:13.
 55 *Chochmas Adam*, 89:1. On relationship of the *Chayei Adam* and the Gra, see Chaim Lieberman, *Ohel Rachel*, 1, p. 471-472; M. Meir, *Rabbi Abraham Danzig and His Works*, (Heb.) MA, Bar Ilan University 2000, p. 26-30.
 56 *Maasei Rav*, 195. See Rav Dovid Kamensky, *Yeshurun* 21 (2009), p. 816. See also Rav Eliach, *HaGaon*, 1, p. 202.
 57 See Rav Menachem Gius, *Chukas Olam*, p. 251-254 [In general this is a very useful work on the subject]; Rav Yehudah Nadviv, *Divrei Halachah*, p. 40-41. The truth is this issue is much more complicated. I hope to deal with it in the near future.
 For general aspects of *Chukat Akum*, see Hirsch Jakob Zimmels, *Chukat Akum* in the Responsa Literature, *Sefer Hayovel Lekavod Chanoch Albeck*, p. 402-424.
 58 *Shu"t Maharsham* 7:55. See also his comments in *Daas Torah* and

Orchos Chayim (Spinka) at the end of *siman* 494.
 59 *Itim LBinah*, p. 254.
 60 *Yosef Daas*, p. 52b.
 61 *Ubuar Orach*, p. 272.
 62 494:10. See Rav T. Tribitz, *Yeshurun* 33 (2015), p. 405.
 63 See *Valeyhu Lo Yivo*, 1, p. 184. Some do not like to rely on this work. However, see the comment in Rav Yosef Eliyahu, *Oro Shel Olam*, p. 137. See also *Shalmei Moed*, p. 459; *Halichos Shlomo* (Pesach), p. 371.
 64 *Orchos Rabbenu* 2, p. 99.
 65 *Pas Sadecha, BiMesilah Naaleh* (2009), p. 85. See also his *Shu"t Pas Sadecha, Orach Chayim* 2, *Kuntres Toras Amecha*, p. 40.
 66 *Yerushalayim B'Moadeha* (Shavuot), p. 184.
 67 *Shu"t Igros Moshe*, Y.D., 4:11 #5.
 68 Introduction to *Igros Moshe* volume 8, p. 6.
 69 *Pirkei Zichronos*, p. 359.
 70 Quoted in Rav Betzalel Landau, *HaGaon Hachasid MiVilna*, p. 103 note 35 and in the *New Maasei Rav* (2009), p. 223. On this work, see *Yeshurun* 6 (1999), p. 239-257; *ibid*, 16 (2005), p. 761-779.
 71 What follows is based on many discussions on the subject with my friend Eli Markin. I hope to elaborate on all this in the future.

72 Brought by Rav Karp in *Hilchos Chag Bechag* (2010), p. 115-116.
 73 *Yerushalmi yehuh*, p. 216.
 74 *Tevuar Haaretz*, back of the 1998 edition.
 75 *Luach*, p. 29.
 76 See Dov Sadan (above note 1).
 77 See the critical edition of this work printed in 1997, p. 48, 65.
 78 Rav Finner, *Mesoras Hatorah V'haneviim*, p. 102.
 79 *Kitzur Hilchos Hamoadim*, p. 6. See also Chaim Grade, *Rabbis and Wives*, New York 1987, p. 157.
 80 Pauline Wengeroff, *Memoirs of a Grandmother*, 2010, p. 150. It's not clear how much one could read into autobiographies if she meant as opposed to trees.
 81 Her father authored an important work called *Minchas Yehudah*. On this work see S. Abramson, *Sinai*, 112 (1993), p. 1-24; N. Steinschneider, *Ir Vilna*, p. 248-249.
 82 A. S. Sachs, *Worlds That Passed* (Jewish Publication Society of America, 1928), p.118. See also *ibid*, p.119-122.
 83 R. A. Hurvitz, *Zichronot Fun Tzvei Dorot*, p. 143.
 All this relates to the acceptance of the Gra's even in *Litvish* circles see Shaul Stampfer, *Families Rabbis and Education*, p. 324-341.